



UNIVERSITY *of the*
WESTERN CAPE

SYNDICATE DISCUSSION: MANAGING WRONG HIRES IN HIGHER EDUCATION INSTITUTIONS

DISCUSSION LEADER: DR QUEEN NTOMBIKAYISE AMBE





UNIVERSITY of the
WESTERN CAPE

OUTLINE

1. Concept of Wrong Hires in HEI
2. Legal Framework for Employment
3. Employment Best Practices
4. Conclusion & Future Directions





Understanding Wrong Hires

Definition and Characteristics:

- . What constitutes a wrong hire?
- . What are the common signs and indicators?



Impact on the Institution:

- . What are the short-term and long-term effects of wrong hires on academic performance, institutional culture, and student outcomes?



1. Concept of Wrong Hires in HEI

- A "wrong hire" refers to an employee who does not meet the required performance standards, fails to integrate into the institutional culture, or is otherwise unsuitable for their role due to personal, professional, or ethical shortcomings.
- In higher education, this could manifest in multiple ways, including academic staff being unable to teach, research, or publish effectively or administrative staff failing to meet service delivery expectations.
- The implications of a wrong hire extend beyond individual performance, potentially affecting student outcomes, the institution's reputation, and the efficient allocation of resources.



1. Concept of Wrong Hires in HEI

Higher education institutions (HEIs) in South Africa are critical in shaping the nation's intellectual and professional capacities.

- Therefore, the recruitment and retention of high-quality academic and administrative staff is not just pivotal, but also a driving force in achieving institutional goals and maintaining educational standards.
- However, like in any other sector, HEIs are not immune to the challenge of wrong hires—employees who either do not meet the performance expectations or are found unsuitable for their roles after appointment.
- This introductory reflection explores the management of wrong hires in higher education, focusing on the legal frameworks and institutional best practices in South Africa.



Legal Implications

Navigating Employment Law:



- What relevant laws and regulations need to be considered in dealing with wrong hires and their implications for managing wrong hires?



Risk Management:

How can institutions mitigate legal risks associated with wrongful termination or discrimination claims?



2. Legal Framework for Employment

South Africa has a robust legal framework that regulates employment relationships, and HEIs must navigate this framework when managing wrong hires, including:

i. Constitution of South Africa (Act 108 of 1996):

- The Bill of Rights provides the overarching legal framework and guarantees equality and dignity, influencing all employment practices. Institutions must align their hiring and management processes with these constitutional values.

ii. The Labour Relations Act (LRA) 66 of 1995:

- The LRA provides for fair labour practices, including provisions on how to manage employee dismissals, retrenchments, and disciplinary actions.
- It ensures that an employee's dismissal, even in the case of poor performance, is procedurally fair.
- HEIs (as employer), must follow due process, which involves providing employees with adequate notice of their performance issues, offering remedial support, and allowing for a fair hearing before dismissal.



2. Legal Framework for Employment

iii. The Employment Equity Act (EEA) 55 of 1998:

- Aim to promote equal opportunity and fair employment treatment by eliminating unfair discrimination.
- It applies to HEIs as they must ensure that hiring and termination processes are free from discriminatory practices, particularly when managing wrong hires.

iv. The Basic Conditions of Employment Act (BCEA) 75 of 1997:

- The BCEA sets minimum employment standards for all HEIs employees.
- The Act outlines employees' rights concerning working hours, leave, and termination notice periods, ensuring that HEIs adhere to legal standards when managing wrong hires.



2. Legal Framework for Employment

v. The Higher Education Act (HEA) 101 of 1997:

- While this Act primarily governs the establishment and operation of higher education institutions in South Africa,
- It indirectly impacts the management of employees within HEIs by outlining expectations for governance and accountability.

vi. University Policies and Frameworks:

- Most South African universities have specific internal recruitment, performance management, and disciplinary policies. Familiarity with these is essential to navigate institutional norms.

vii. Common Law and Case Law:

- Previous court rulings can influence hiring practices. Institutions must stay informed about legal precedents regarding wrongful dismissal and other employment-related issues.



Recruitment Practices

Best Practices in Hiring:

- . What strategies can be employed to minimise the risk of wrong hires?
- . What's the importance of clear job descriptions, diverse hiring committees, and structured interviews?

Role of Background Checks and References:

Let's discuss the effectiveness and ethical considerations of conducting thorough background checks.



3. Employment Best Practices

HEIs must adopt a proactive approach that integrates institutional best practices to manage wrong hires while effectively adhering to the legal framework. This legal framework includes regulations related to discrimination, labour laws, and employee rights. **These practices should address the issue of unsuitable employees and prevent the occurrence of wrong hires in the first place.**

(i) Comprehensive Recruitment and Selection Processes

- Prevention is the first step in managing wrong hires.
- HEIs should implement rigorous recruitment and selection processes, including thorough background checks, performance evaluations, and competency assessments. These comprehensive processes not only ensure the suitability of the candidates but also provide a sense of security about the quality of the hires. Engaging multiple stakeholders in the hiring process—such as departmental heads, academic peers, and human resources—is crucial. This ensures that new hires meet the institution's technical and cultural needs as they are evaluated from various perspectives.



3. Employment Best Practices

(ii) Performance Management Systems

- Continuous performance management is a key aspect of managing wrong hires. Once hired, employees should be subject to this process, which helps in identifying and addressing underperformance early.
- HEIs should implement clear performance metrics for academic and administrative staff.
- Performance management systems help to identify underperformance early and enable institutions to intervene with support or remedial measures before the situation escalates.
- This may involve mentoring, additional training, or targeted professional development opportunities to address skill gaps.



3. Employment Best Practices

(iii). Remediation and Support Mechanisms

- When an employee is identified as a wrong hire, HEIs must offer remediation and support before resorting to disciplinary process.
- This may involve offering counselling services, upskilling programs, or reassigning employees to roles better suited to their abilities.
- By providing these support systems, institutions can avoid costly and potentially litigious termination.

(iv) . Adherence to Procedural Fairness in Termination

- When termination becomes inevitable, HEIs must follow the procedures set out in the LRA to avoid legal repercussions.
- This includes providing written warnings, conducting performance improvement programs, and allowing employees to defend their cases in disciplinary hearings.
- Adherence to procedural fairness is not only a legal requirement but also an institutional best practice that maintains the integrity and reputation of the HEI.



3. Employment Best Practices

(v). Building a Supportive Institutional Culture

- HEIs should create an inclusive and supportive work environment that promotes open communication, collaboration, and professional growth.
- By fostering a supportive institutional culture, HEIs can significantly reduce the incidence of wrong hires. This is achieved by creating an environment where employees feel valued and empowered to succeed, leading to a more productive and harmonious workplace.
- A positive culture helps to integrate new hires more effectively, reducing the likelihood of performance issues.

(vi) Exit Interviews and Lessons Learned

- Conduct exit interviews when employees leave, especially in cases of resignation following poor performance or mutual separation.
- The feedback from exit interviews is a goldmine of insights. It can reveal institutional weaknesses in recruitment, onboarding, or employee support, enabling HEIs to refine their processes and prevent future wrong hires.

(vii) Legal and HR Training:

- Regular training of HR staff and hiring committees on legal compliance and best practices is crucial. It significantly reduces the risk of wrongful hiring or dismissal, ensuring a fair and legally sound workplace.

(viii) Culture of Inclusivity:

- Promote a culture that values diversity and inclusion, which can help attract a broader range of candidates and improve retention.





UNIVERSITY *of the*
WESTERN CAPE

CASE STUDIES AND EXPERIENCES

SUCCESSFUL INTERVENTIONS:

- Share examples where your institutions have effectively managed wrong hires and improved their hiring processes.

LESSONS LEARNED:

- What common challenges are faced by the different institutions in managing wrong hires, and what institutions can learn from them?





4. Conclusion and Future Directions

- Managing wrong hires in higher education requires a delicate balance between adhering to legal frameworks and implementing effective institutional practices.
- HEIs operate under a comprehensive legal regime emphasising fairness, non-discrimination, and procedural integrity.
- At the same time, institutions must proactively address the issue of wrong hires by strengthening recruitment processes, implementing performance management systems, and fostering a supportive institutional culture.
- Doing so mitigates the negative impact of wrong hires and ensures they attract and retain the talent necessary to fulfil their educational mission. >



UNIVERSITY of the
WESTERN CAPE

4. Conclusion and Future Directions

Future Directions >>>

Adapting to Changing Needs:

- How can higher education institutions evolve hiring practices to meet future challenges, such as digital transformation?

Collaboration and Resource Sharing:

- Opportunities for collaboration among institutions to share best practices and resources related to hiring and management.





UNIVERSITY *of the*
WESTERN CAPE

Thank You.

Further Discussions

